



Hereditary Musicians: Hindustani Music and the Public Sphere in Late Nineteenth Century Calcutta"

Reader One

This article offers useful and original perspectives on the social development of Hindustani music in 19th/20th-century Bengal by contrasting its position in the so-called private and public spheres. In its present form, however, it gives evidence of haste and requires careful and attentive editing and revision. There are a number of careless grammatical and stylistic slips (exx: p3, sent 1 of para 2, p12 sent 1, p14 sent 2 after quote, etc.), the prose is prolix, and the author's argument would be strengthened by a more concise, direct, and lucid presentation.

Reader Two.

Please see the pdf for detailed comments.

Contribution to Scholarship (Is the paper substantial? Original? What would be its standing in relation to the body of existing literature? Does it make an important contribution to its field?)

It is important enough to be published, and brings in new (to me) historical data. It could use additional resources, particularly an excellent recent Ph.D. dissertation on Bengal that I reference in the PDF.

Evidence (Is new evidence brought to light, or are there new insights provided on existing data?)

There is new evidence, and somewhat new insights

Analysis (Is the paper sufficiently analytical, or too factual and/or descriptive?)

It is sufficiently Analytic.

Hypothesis/Conclusion/Argument (Are these clear, appropriately developed and suitably drawn?)

Yes; the central point of this paper is the need for developing history for a tradition that was overwhelmingly oral and had very little in the way of biography.

Readability (Is the paper well written? Interesting or dull? Will it attract a wide readership?)

I think the paper is quite readable and will be of interest to Hindustani music people and Bengal specialists

I consider this a good article publishable with minor corrections and revisions. You can read me comments through the PDF that I have attached along with this document.